

# Contents

---

|                                    |      |
|------------------------------------|------|
| <i>List of Contributors</i>        | xiii |
| <i>Preface</i>                     | xv   |
| <i>About the Companion Website</i> | xix  |

## **Part I INTRODUCTION AND THEORETICAL CONCEPTS 1**

### **1 Genotype-by-Environment Interactions and Sexual Selection: Female Choice in a Complex World 3**

Michael J. Wade

|       |                                                                      |    |
|-------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 1.1   | Introduction                                                         | 3  |
| 1.2   | Classical female choice                                              | 4  |
| 1.3   | The instability of "good genes" when male quality is a complex trait | 6  |
| 1.3.1 | Additive effects of genes on genotypic value                         | 8  |
| 1.3.2 | Genotype-by-environment interaction                                  | 9  |
| 1.3.3 | Gene-by-gene interaction                                             | 12 |
| 1.3.4 | Indirect genetic effects <i>sensu</i> quantitative genetics          | 13 |
| 1.4   | Discussion                                                           | 16 |
|       | Acknowledgments                                                      | 17 |
|       | References                                                           | 17 |

### **2 GEIs when Information Transfer is Uncertain or Incomplete 19**

Thomas Getty

|     |                                         |    |
|-----|-----------------------------------------|----|
| 2.1 | Introduction                            | 19 |
| 2.2 | Lewontin's "very annoying conclusions"  | 21 |
| 2.3 | Ignorance, uncertainty, and information | 21 |
| 2.4 | Information and fitness                 | 22 |

|          |                                                                                        |           |
|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| 2.5      | Bayesian Statistical Decision Theory                                                   | 23        |
| 2.6      | Discrimination and selection: the signal detection perspective                         | 24        |
| 2.7      | Search, discrimination, and mate choice by female pied flycatchers                     | 25        |
| 2.8      | Optimal search and the marginal value of additional information                        | 29        |
| 2.9      | Biological signaling theory                                                            | 31        |
| 2.10     | GEIs in condition, signals, and preferences                                            | 32        |
| 2.11     | Conclusions                                                                            | 37        |
|          | References                                                                             | 38        |
| <b>3</b> | <b>Local Adaptation and the Evolution of Female Choice</b>                             | <b>41</b> |
|          | Luke Holman and Hanna Kokko                                                            |           |
| 3.1      | Introduction                                                                           | 41        |
| 3.2      | The Jekyll and Hyde nature of GEIs                                                     | 43        |
| 3.3      | The model                                                                              | 46        |
| 3.3.1    | Overview                                                                               | 46        |
| 3.3.2    | Initialization phase                                                                   | 46        |
| 3.3.3    | Dispersal                                                                              | 49        |
| 3.3.4    | Determination of condition and viability selection                                     | 49        |
| 3.3.5    | Breeding                                                                               | 49        |
| 3.3.6    | Mutation                                                                               | 50        |
| 3.4      | Less local adaptation, <i>more</i> female choice!                                      | 51        |
| 3.5      | Can we generalize?                                                                     | 52        |
| 3.6      | GEIs often maintain costly choice in a suitably variable world                         | 53        |
| 3.7      | Insights from the model                                                                | 55        |
| 3.8      | Prospects for empirical work                                                           | 56        |
| 3.9      | Prospects for theoretical work                                                         | 57        |
| 3.10     | Conclusions                                                                            | 59        |
|          | References                                                                             | 59        |
| <b>4</b> | <b>Genotype-by-Environment Interactions when the Social Environment Contains Genes</b> | <b>63</b> |
|          | Jason B. Wolf, Nick J. Royle, and John Hunt                                            |           |
| 4.1      | Introduction                                                                           | 63        |
| 4.2      | Modeling genotype-by-social environment interactions                                   | 64        |
| 4.2.1    | A simple GEI model when the environment is abiotic                                     | 65        |
| 4.2.2    | A simple model for gene interactions                                                   | 69        |
| 4.2.3    | A simple GSEI model                                                                    | 73        |
| 4.2.4    | Summary                                                                                | 78        |
| 4.3      | Measuring genotype by social environment interactions                                  | 79        |
| 4.4      | Empirical evidence for genotype by social environment interactions                     | 84        |
| 4.5      | Future directions                                                                      | 91        |

|                                                                                                                                  |            |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| Acknowledgments                                                                                                                  | 94         |
| References                                                                                                                       | 94         |
| <b>Part II PRACTICAL ISSUES FOR MEASURING GEIs</b>                                                                               | <b>99</b>  |
| <b>5 Quantifying Genotype-by-Environment Interactions in Laboratory Systems</b>                                                  | <b>101</b> |
| Derek A. Roff and Alastair J. Wilson                                                                                             |            |
| 5.1 Introduction                                                                                                                 | 101        |
| 5.2 Two perspectives on phenotypic plasticity                                                                                    | 102        |
| 5.2.1 The character state approach                                                                                               | 102        |
| 5.2.2 Norm of reaction approach                                                                                                  | 103        |
| 5.3 Breeding designs to detect and estimate $G \times E$                                                                         | 105        |
| 5.3.1 Common garden                                                                                                              | 105        |
| 5.3.2 Clones                                                                                                                     | 106        |
| 5.3.3 Inbred lines                                                                                                               | 107        |
| 5.3.4 Isofemale lines                                                                                                            | 108        |
| 5.3.5 Conventional breeding designs                                                                                              | 108        |
| 5.3.6 "Unconventional" pedigree designs                                                                                          | 109        |
| 5.3.7 Selection experiments                                                                                                      | 109        |
| 5.4 Statistical methodologies                                                                                                    | 109        |
| 5.4.1 Mixed-model analysis of variance                                                                                           | 110        |
| 5.4.2 Linear mixed effect model                                                                                                  | 111        |
| 5.4.3 The animal model                                                                                                           | 113        |
| 5.4.4 Individually fitted functions                                                                                              | 115        |
| 5.4.5 Random regression models                                                                                                   | 119        |
| 5.4.6 Random regression models as covariance functions                                                                           | 120        |
| 5.4.7 Multivariate models                                                                                                        | 121        |
| 5.5 Worked examples                                                                                                              | 122        |
| 5.5.1 Example 1                                                                                                                  | 122        |
| 5.5.2 Example 2                                                                                                                  | 126        |
| 5.5.3 Example 3                                                                                                                  | 130        |
| 5.6 Recommendations                                                                                                              | 133        |
| Acknowledgments                                                                                                                  | 134        |
| References                                                                                                                       | 134        |
| <b>6 Influence of the Environment on the Genetic Architecture of Traits Involved in Sexual Selection within Wild Populations</b> | <b>137</b> |
| Matthew R. Robinson and Anna Qvarnström                                                                                          |            |
| 6.1 Introduction                                                                                                                 | 137        |
| 6.2 Application of sexual selection theory to wild populations                                                                   | 139        |
| 6.2.1 Identifying the key parameters                                                                                             | 139        |
| 6.2.2 Acquisition and allocation determine the form of GEI                                                                       | 140        |

|       |                                                        |     |
|-------|--------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 6.2.3 | The genetic basis of female mate choice may show GEI   | 143 |
| 6.2.4 | Fitness associations may be environmentally dependent  | 144 |
| 6.2.5 | Covariance between the sexes                           | 146 |
| 6.3   | Methods for examining GEI in wild populations          | 146 |
| 6.3.1 | Identifying the relevant environmental variables       | 147 |
| 6.3.2 | The "animal" model                                     | 148 |
| 6.3.3 | Character-state approach                               | 148 |
| 6.3.4 | Factor analytic models                                 | 150 |
| 6.3.5 | Autoregressive functions                               | 151 |
| 6.3.6 | Reaction norm models: random regressions               | 151 |
| 6.3.7 | Estimating environmental sensitivity as an alternative | 155 |
| 6.3.8 | Estimating genetic covariance across environments      | 156 |
| 6.3.9 | Estimating covariance with fitness across environments | 157 |
| 6.4   | Worked examples of the analysis methods                | 158 |
| 6.5   | Summary                                                | 164 |
|       | References                                             | 165 |

|          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |            |
|----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>7</b> | <b>From Genotype <math>\times</math> Environment to Transcriptome <math>\times</math> Environment: Identifying and Understanding Environmental Influences in the Gene Expression Underlying Sexually Selected Traits</b> | <b>169</b> |
|          | Jennifer C. Perry and Judith E. Mank                                                                                                                                                                                     |            |
| 7.1      | Introduction                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 169        |
| 7.2      | Gene expression variation allows a static genome to respond to varying environments                                                                                                                                      | 170        |
| 7.3      | From GEIs to TEIs in sexually selected traits                                                                                                                                                                            | 172        |
| 7.4      | Can we safely ignore the genomic basis of phenotypes?                                                                                                                                                                    | 174        |
| 7.5      | The first step is identifying the transcriptomic basis of sexually selected traits                                                                                                                                       | 175        |
| 7.6      | A note on gene expression and sexually selected behavior                                                                                                                                                                 | 178        |
| 7.7      | The next step is to understand how gene expression responds to environmental influences                                                                                                                                  | 179        |
| 7.8      | A few notes on technology and experimental design                                                                                                                                                                        | 180        |
| 7.9      | Conclusion                                                                                                                                                                                                               | 182        |
|          | Acknowledgments                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 183        |
|          | References                                                                                                                                                                                                               | 183        |

|                 |                                                                                                                |            |
|-----------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>Part III</b> | <b>EMPIRICAL STUDIES ON GEIs AND SEXUAL SELECTION</b>                                                          | <b>189</b> |
| <b>8</b>        | <b>Phenotypic Plasticity and Genotype <math>\times</math> Environment Interactions in Animal Communication</b> | <b>191</b> |
|                 | Michael D. Greenfield                                                                                          |            |
| 8.1             | Introduction                                                                                                   | 191        |
| 8.1.1           | GEI and the lek paradox                                                                                        | 193        |
| 8.1.2           | GEI and signal (un)reliability                                                                                 | 194        |
| 8.1.3           | <i>Achroia grisella</i> : a model species for sexual selection studies                                         | 195        |
| 8.2             | Natural history and acoustic communication                                                                     | 196        |
| 8.3             | Quantitative genetics of song and preference                                                                   | 199        |
| 8.3.1           | Do genetic tradeoffs maintain $V_A$ for song traits?                                                           | 199        |
| 8.3.2           | GEI, ecological crossover, and the maintenance of $V_A$                                                        | 200        |
| 8.4             | On the role of GEI in natural populations                                                                      | 203        |
| 8.4.1           | Indirect genetic effects (IGEs)                                                                                | 203        |
| 8.4.2           | Reaction norm diversity and ecological crossover                                                               | 203        |
| 8.4.3           | Does environmental heterogeneity help to sustain $V_A$ ?                                                       | 204        |
| 8.4.4           | Synopsis                                                                                                       | 205        |
| 8.5             | Are male songs reliable signals?                                                                               | 206        |
| 8.6             | Prognosis                                                                                                      | 207        |
|                 | Acknowledgments                                                                                                | 208        |
|                 | References                                                                                                     | 208        |
| <b>9</b>        | <b>The Use of Inbreeding to Assess the Genetic Component of Condition Underlying GEIs in Sexual Traits</b>     | <b>213</b> |
|                 | Lawrence Bellamy, Kevin Fowler, and Andrew Pomiankowski                                                        |            |
| 9.1             | Introduction                                                                                                   | 213        |
| 9.2             | Sexual traits and genetic condition                                                                            | 214        |
| 9.3             | Studies of environmental variation                                                                             | 215        |
| 9.4             | Studies of genetic variation                                                                                   | 216        |
| 9.5             | The use of inbreeding to infer the genetics of condition-dependent traits                                      | 217        |
| 9.6             | Designing inbreeding experiments                                                                               | 218        |
| 9.6.1           | Choice of control traits                                                                                       | 218        |
| 9.6.2           | Controlling for body size covariation                                                                          | 220        |
| 9.6.3           | Outbred controls                                                                                               | 220        |
| 9.6.4           | Experimental scale                                                                                             | 221        |
| 9.6.5           | GEI                                                                                                            | 221        |

|           |                                                                                                              |            |
|-----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 9.7       | Methods                                                                                                      | 222        |
| 9.8       | Results                                                                                                      | 223        |
| 9.8.1     | Fish                                                                                                         | 223        |
| 9.8.2     | Birds                                                                                                        | 229        |
| 9.8.3     | Arthropods                                                                                                   | 230        |
| 9.9       | Discussion                                                                                                   | 232        |
| 9.9.1     | Do secondary sexual traits suffer from inbreeding depression?                                                | 232        |
| 9.9.2     | Does inbreeding depression in sexual traits persist after controlling for body size?                         | 233        |
| 9.9.3     | Do sexual traits suffer greater inbreeding depression than non-sexual traits?                                | 233        |
| 9.9.4     | Does inbreeding reveal condition-dependent GEIs?                                                             | 234        |
| 9.10      | Concluding remarks                                                                                           | 235        |
|           | Acknowledgments                                                                                              | 236        |
|           | References                                                                                                   | 236        |
| <b>10</b> | <b>Genotype-by-Environment Interactions and Reliable Signaling of Male Quality in Bank Voles</b>             | <b>241</b> |
|           | Suzanne C. Mills, Mikael Mokkonen, Esa Koskela, and Tapio Mappes                                             |            |
| 10.1      | Introduction                                                                                                 | 241        |
| 10.2      | The bank vole                                                                                                | 242        |
| 10.2.1    | Environmental heterogeneity                                                                                  | 244        |
| 10.2.2    | Female reproductive success                                                                                  | 244        |
| 10.2.3    | Male signals, heritability, and reliability                                                                  | 245        |
| 10.2.4    | Intralocus sexual conflict                                                                                   | 247        |
| 10.3      | GEIs on male dominance in the bank vole                                                                      | 249        |
| 10.4      | Suggestions to reconcile the disruption of the signal-preference covariance                                  | 251        |
| 10.4.1    | Parallel norms of reaction for male signal and female mate preference                                        | 251        |
| 10.4.2    | Alternative strategies for male signal and female preferences                                                | 256        |
| 10.4.3    | GEI on female reproductive success and sexual conflict                                                       | 257        |
| 10.5      | Summary                                                                                                      | 258        |
|           | References                                                                                                   | 259        |
| <b>11</b> | <b>Sexual Selection and Genotype-by-Environment Interactions in <i>Drosophila</i> Cuticular Hydrocarbons</b> | <b>265</b> |
|           | Fiona C. Ingleby, David J. Hosken, and John Hunt                                                             |            |
| 11.1      | Introduction                                                                                                 | 265        |
| 11.2      | Abiotic environments                                                                                         | 267        |
| 11.2.1    | Temperature and desiccation stress                                                                           | 267        |
| 11.2.2    | Dietary effects and condition dependence                                                                     | 270        |

|           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |            |
|-----------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 11.3      | Biotic environments                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | 271        |
| 11.3.1    | IGEs on <i>D. serrata</i> CHC expression                                                                                                                                                                                                    | 273        |
| 11.3.2    | Circadian clocks and the social environment in <i>D. melanogaster</i> CHC expression                                                                                                                                                        | 274        |
| 11.4      | Consequences of GEI and environmental variation in <i>Drosophila</i> CHCs and directions for future research                                                                                                                                | 275        |
|           | Acknowledgments                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 278        |
|           | References                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | 278        |
| <b>12</b> | <b>Genotype-by-Environment Interactions and Sexual Selection in Guppies</b>                                                                                                                                                                 | <b>282</b> |
|           | Gita R. Kolluru                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |            |
| 12.1      | Introduction                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | 282        |
| 12.1.1    | Overview                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | 282        |
| 12.1.2    | Phenotypic responses to environmental variation                                                                                                                                                                                             | 283        |
| 12.1.3    | GEI and sexual selection                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | 285        |
| 12.2      | Plasticity, GEI, and the guppy system                                                                                                                                                                                                       | 286        |
| 12.2.1    | The guppy mating system                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | 286        |
| 12.2.2    | Sexually selected traits in guppies                                                                                                                                                                                                         | 287        |
| 12.2.3    | Environmental influences on sexually selected guppy traits                                                                                                                                                                                  | 289        |
| 12.2.4    | Environmental heterogeneity in guppy populations                                                                                                                                                                                            | 297        |
| 12.3      | Summary and future directions                                                                                                                                                                                                               | 300        |
| 12.3.1    | Guppies and the positive and negative effects of GEI on sexually selected traits                                                                                                                                                            | 300        |
| 12.3.2    | Behavioral syndromes as an emerging focus                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 302        |
| 12.3.3    | The challenge of human-induced environmental changes                                                                                                                                                                                        | 303        |
|           | Acknowledgments                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 304        |
|           | References                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | 304        |
| <b>13</b> | <b>Signal Reliability, Sex-Specific Genotype-by-Environment Interactions in Cuticular Hydrocarbon Expression, and the Maintenance of Polyandry through Chemosensory Self-Referencing in Decorated Crickets, <i>Gryllodes sigillatus</i></b> | <b>312</b> |
|           | Scott K. Sakaluk, Carie Weddle, and John Hunt                                                                                                                                                                                               |            |
| 13.1      | Introduction                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | 312        |
| 13.2      | Sexual selection and polyandry in <i>Gryllodes sigillatus</i>                                                                                                                                                                               | 314        |
| 13.3      | Cuticular hydrocarbons in <i>G. sigillatus</i>                                                                                                                                                                                              | 317        |
| 13.4      | Chemosensory self-referencing and the preference for novel males                                                                                                                                                                            | 318        |

|      |                                                                       |     |
|------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 13.5 | Sex-specific GEs and the reliability of chemosensory self-referencing | 323 |
| 13.6 | Conclusion                                                            | 325 |
|      | Acknowledgments                                                       | 326 |
|      | References                                                            | 326 |
|      | <i>Conclusions and Final Thoughts</i>                                 | 331 |
|      | <i>Index</i>                                                          | 335 |