

Contents

Preface	xiii
Prologue	xxi
1. Introduction	1
Science as Argumentation Within the Experiment and Within the Community	1
Scientific Argumentation and Logic	5
The Multifaceted Notion of Irreproducibility	7
Productive Irreproducibility	9
Ontology Versus Epistemology	11
The Use of Logical Formalism	13
Summary	15
2. The Problem of Irreproducibility	17
Type I and II Errors	18
Controlling the Inevitability of Irreproducibility Risk	20
Institutional Responses	22
Reproducibility and Irreproducibility	23
Contributions of Logic to Biomedical Research	26
Reductionism and Conceptual (Broad) Irreproducibility	26
Variability, Central Tendency, Chaos, and Complexity	29
Conceptual Reproducibility and the Importance of Hypothesis Generation	35
Summary	37
3. Validity of Biomedical Science, Reproducibility, and Irreproducibility	39
Science Must Be Doing Something Right and Therein Lies Reproducibility and Productive Irreproducibility	39
Science Versus Human Knowledge of It	42
The Necessity of Enabling Assumptions	44
Special Cases of Irreproducible Reproducibility	51

Science as Inference to the Best Explanation	53
Summary	54
 4. The Logic of Certainty Versus the Logic of Discovery	 57
Certainty, Reproducibility, and Logic	57
Deductive Logic—Certainty and Limitations	59
Syllogistic Deduction	61
Judicious Use of the Fallacy of Four Terms	67
Partial, Probability, Practical, and Causal Syllogisms	74
Propositional Logic	78
Induction	83
The Duhem—Quine Thesis	90
Summary	91
 5. The Logic of Probability and Statistics	 93
The Value of the Logical Perspective in Probability and Statistics	94
Metaphysics: Ontology Versus Epistemology and Biomedical Reproducibility	96
Independence of Probabilities and Regression Toward the Mean	102
Avoiding the Fallacy of Four Terms	106
The Conflation of Ontology and Epistemology	118
Summary	121
 6. Causation, Process Metaphor, and Reductionism	 123
Practical Syllogism and Beyond	123
Centrality of Hypothesis to Experimentation and Centrality of Causation to Hypothesis Generation	126
Reductionism and the Fallacies of Composition and Division	132
Other Fallacies as Applied to Cause	138
Discipline in the Principle of Causational and Informational Synonymy	139
Summary	140
 7. Case Studies in Clinical Biomedical Research	 141
Forbearance of Repetition	141
Setting the Stage	142
Clinical Meaningfulness	144
Statistics and Internal Validity	145
Establishing Clinical Meaningfulness	148
Specific Features to Look for in Case Studies	151
Case Study—Two Conflicting Studies of Hormone Use in Postmenopausal Women, Which Is Irreproducible?	152
Summary	164

8. Case Studies in Basic Biomedical Research	165
Forbearance of Repetition	165
Purpose	165
Setting the Stage	166
The Value of a Tool from Its Intended Use	167
What is Basic Biomedical Research?	168
Scientific Meaning Versus Statistical Significance	170
Reproducibility and the Willingness to Ignore Irreproducibility	173
Specific Features to Look For in Case Studies	174
Case Study—Pathophysiology of Parkinsonism and Physiology of the Basal Ganglia	176
Summary	191
9. Case Studies in Computational Biomedical Research	193
Scope of Computation in Biomedical Research	193
Importance of Mathematical and Computational Modeling and Simulations	196
The Notion of Irreproducibility in Mathematical and Computational Modeling and Simulations	198
Sources of Irreproducibility in the Narrow Sense	200
Compilation Versus Runtime Errors	202
Complexity and Chaos and Underdetermination in Computational Modeling and Simulations	203
The Necessity of Biological Constraints and the Fallacy of Confirming the Consequence	206
Setting the Stage	208
Computational Meaningfulness	209
Specific Features to Look for in Mathematical and Computational Studies	210
Case Studies	211
Summary	219
10. Chaotic and Complex Systems, Statistics, and Far-from-Equilibrium Thermodynamics	221
Limitations of Traditional Statistics	221
Resistance to Statistics	223
Large Number Theorem	224
But What if the Large Number Theorem Does Not Hold?	226
Equilibrium and Steady-State Conditions	233
Biological Machines, Thermodynamics, and Statistical Mechanics	233
Recognition of Complexity in Biomedical Research	240
Summary	242
11. Epilog: An Ounce of Prevention...	243
Hypothesis Generation	244
Induction	245

Discounting Philosophy	248
Rise of Scientism	250
Some Suggestions	255
Ethical Obligations	257
Appendix A: An Introduction to the Logic of Logic	259
Appendix B: Introduction to the Logic of Probability and Statistics	275
Glossary of Concepts	299
Bibliography	313
Index	325